

**Meeting Minutes of the Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review
Thursday, February 13, 2025, at 5:30 PM
Spartanburg County Council Chambers**

The City of Spartanburg Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review (HARB) met in County Council Chambers on Thursday, February 13, 2025, at 5:30 PM with the following members in attendance: **Bill Michels, Dr. Glory Boozer, Kenneth Brown, Sylvelie Franke, Rod McCants, and Brandon Gaffney** Representing the Planning Department - **Fredalyn Frasier, Planning Director, Nan Zhou, Planner II, and Oksana Holbrooks, Sr Administrative Assistant.**

Roll Call:

Mr. Michels: Bill Michels
Mr. Brown: Kenneth Brown
Mr. McCants: Rod McCants
Mr. Gaffney: Brandon Gaffney
Ms. Franke: Sylvelie Franke
Dr. Boozer: Glory Boozer

Mr. Michels: Freedom of Information Act Compliance – Public notification of the City of Spartanburg Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review (HARB) this meeting has been published, posted and mailed in compliance with the Freedom of Information Act and the requirements of the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance.

Approval of Agenda:

A motion was made by Dr. Boozer, seconded by Mr. Gaffney to approve the agenda. The motion was approved with a vote of 6-0.

Approval of Meeting Minutes from January 9, 2024.

A motion was made by Mr. Brown, seconded by Ms. Franke to approve the meeting minutes as amended. The motion was approved with a vote of 6-0.

Old Business: None.

New Business:

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Works – 202 Brookwood Ter. (TMS # 7-12-14-294.00) in the Hampton Heights Neighborhood Historic District. The applicant is seeking approval to replace the siding and repair the side porch guardrail. The property is located in the R-8 SFD (General Residential – Single-Family) zoning district. Owner / Contractor: Juan Sharp – Two Sharp Enterprises LLC

Project Description and History

The project site is located on an approximately 6,850 square foot lot in the Hampton Heights Historic District on the north side of Brookwood Terrace. The site includes one single-family one-story residential bungalow with a brick foundation constructed in 1940. The structure has a porch on the right side of the house and has a gable roof with composite shingle.

A Stop Work Order was issued by Building Official of City of Spartanburg in January when it was observed that the aluminum siding was being removed and replaced with vinyl siding and that repairs to the side porch guardrail were made without a Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit. The owner was notified to apply for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Analysis

Zoning Ordinance and Historic Design Manual Consistency

The design guidelines are outlined in the Hampton Heights Design Guidelines for the City of Spartanburg Historic District Preservation Principles and Approaches. The purpose of the Guidelines is to provide property owners guidance for the preservation and protection of historic and architecturally valuable districts and sites in the City. The project is also subject to Section 510 of the City's Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation. This section allows the Board to review applications involving historic structures and districts and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the Standards listed in the Ordinance.

The project site has a zoning designation of R-8 SFD, General Residential – Single Family District, which allows for single family dwelling unit. Section 510.6 of the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance list standards for reviewing Certificate of Appropriateness. Specifically, Section 510.6 (C)(2) states that in reviewing applications for new construction or alteration, the Board shall consider the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the five criteria listed in the findings.

Applicant Statement

The Applicant proposes replacing the aluminum siding with new vinyl siding and repairing the side porch guardrails.

Findings

Certificate of Appropriateness, Section 510.6 (C)

a. The character and appropriateness of the design

Design Guidelines for Hampton Heights state that “..... The dominant exterior materials used in a neighborhood or historic district contribute to the visual relationships among buildings. Retain original wood siding and repair rather than replace damaged material whenever possible. When replacement is necessary, replace only deteriorated materials and match the original material in size, shape, texture, and material. Paint removal and repainting shall be done using appropriate techniques that do not damage the historic material. The application of artificial or nonhistorical exterior siding materials such as brick veneers; asphalt shingle siding; and cementitious, aluminum, or vinyl siding is strongly discouraged. These materials are not successful in mimicking details of original wood siding (the most common material over which they are applied); subsequently, their use greatly compromises the historic integrity of buildings. Application often results in the loss or distortion of architectural details, and improper installation can result in damage of historic materials.”

“.....Architectural details shall be maintained and treated with sensitivity. The removal of such details or application of details inappropriate to the period or style of a house is strongly discouraged. Repair rather than replace damaged elements whenever possible. Historic details that have been lost or are beyond repair may be replaced with new materials, provided that their earlier presence can be substantiated by historical evidence and that the new materials match the original in composition, design, color, and texture.”

- The applicant proposes to remove the existing aluminum siding and replace it with vinyl siding. Repair/replace side porch siding using wood matches the original in texture and composition. However, the guardrail being installed on the house does not match the architectural detailed design of the historical guardrail.
- The Design Guidelines for the Hampton Heights states that “..... original wood siding should be retained and repair rather than replacement. When replacement is necessary, replace only deteriorated materials and match the original material in size, shape, texture, and material. Vinyl siding and aluminum siding is strongly discouraged,” and that “application of architectural details inappropriately to the period or style of a house is strongly discouraged. The new replacement should match the original in composition, design, color and texture, and that their earlier presence can be substantiated by historical evidence.”

b. The scale of the buildings

- Replacing siding and guardrail will not impact the scale of the building.

c. The texture and materials

- Currently, the existing siding is aluminum with wood siding underneath. The new proposed siding is vinyl; The new guardrail is wood.

d. The relationship of such elements to similar features of structures in the immediate surroundings –

- Properties in the immediate surroundings of the project site have a combination of vinyl siding and wood siding.

e. If the property is in a Historic District, the extent to which the alteration or construction would be harmonious with the Historic District –

The Design Guidelines Hampton Heights states that “.....The dominant exterior materials used in a neighborhood or historic district contribute to the visual relationships among buildings. Retain original wood siding and repair rather than replace damaged material whenever possible. When replacement is necessary, replace only deteriorated materials and match the original material in size, shape, texture, and material. Paint removal and repainting shall be done using appropriate techniques that do not damage the historic material.

The application of artificial or nonhistorical exterior siding materials such as brick veneers; asphalt shingle siding; and cementitious, aluminum, or vinyl siding is strongly discouraged. These materials are not successful in mimicking details of original wood siding (the most common material over which they are applied); subsequently, their use greatly compromises the historic integrity of buildings. Application often results in the loss or distortion of architectural details, and improper installation can result in damage of historic materials.”

“.....Architectural details shall be maintained and treated with sensitivity. The removal of such details or application of details inappropriate to the period or style of a house is strongly discouraged. Repair rather than replace damaged elements whenever possible. Historic details that have been lost or are beyond repair may be replaced with new materials, provided that their earlier presence can be substantiated by historical evidence and that the new materials match the original in composition, design, color, and texture”

- Replacement of the siding with vinyl siding would not be harmonious with the Hampton Heights Historic District. Replacement of the guardrail with wood is appropriate, however, the architectural detailed design should match the historic guardrail.

- Based on the Design Guidelines for Hampton Heights, the new replacement siding should match the original material in size, shape, texture, and material. The application of artificial or nonhistorical exterior siding materials such as vinyl siding and aluminum siding are strongly discouraged. Historic details that have been lost or are beyond repair may be replaced with new materials, provided that their earlier presence can be substantiated by historical evidence and that the new materials match the original in composition, design, color, and texture.

Applicant:

Juan Sharp, Two Sharp Enterprises.

Public Speakers:

None

Discussion:

The board will likely discussed the asbestos recommendation and the necessary steps to either remove and repair or replace the material with wood. Based on past cases, the board has consistently not approved vinyl as a replacement material. Given that this situation follows a stop work order, all previous work must be redone in compliance with the historic guidelines, ensuring that any repairs or replacements adhere to established standards and historic preservation requirements.

A motion was made by Mr. Michels, seconded Mr. Gaffney to deny the application as presented in its entirety, and the case be deferred to city staff to replace the siding with Mr. Loves expertise by a vote of 6-0.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Works – 200 Brookwood Ter. (TMS # 7-12-14-293.00) in the Hampton Heights Neighborhood Historic District. The applicant is seeking approval to replace the front door, replace/repair the rear porch, repair siding, and install white vinyl siding on two side walls. The property is located in the R-8 SFD (General Residential – Single-Family) zoning district. Owner: Duchela Investments LLC / Applicant: CEF & CD / Contractor: PI Construction & Roofing LLC

Project Description and History

The project site is located on an approximately 8,348 square foot lot in the Hampton Heights Historic District on the north side of Brookwood Terrace. The site currently comprises one single-family residence constructed in 1942. The residential structure is a one-story wood framed bungalow with a brick foundation and has a back porch and a gable roof with composite shingle.

The Building Department issued a Stop Work Order in January 2025 when it was observed wood siding was removed and replaced with vinyl siding on two sides of the house and back porch was replaced/repared without a Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit. The owner/general contractor was notified to apply for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Analysis

Zoning Ordinance and Historic Design Manual Consistency

The design guidelines are outlined in the Hampton Heights Design Guidelines for the City of Spartanburg Historic District Preservation Principles and Approaches. The purpose of the Guidelines is to provide property owners guidance for the preservation and protection of historic and architecturally valuable districts and sites in the City. The project is also subject to Section 510 of the City's Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation. This section allows the Board to review applications involving historic structures and districts and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the Standards listed in the Ordinance.

The project site has a zoning designation of R-8 SFD, General Residential – Single Family District, which allows for single family dwelling unit. Section 510.6 of the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance list standards for reviewing Certificate of Appropriateness. Specifically, Section 510.6 (C)(2) states that in reviewing applications for new construction or alteration, the Board shall consider the U.S. Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and the five criteria listed in the findings.

Applicant Statement

- The Applicant proposes to repair siding using the wood siding from the back and install new vinyl siding on two sides walls, replace the back porch, and replace the front door with a metal door.

Findings

Certificate of Appropriateness, Section 510.6 (C)

a. The character and appropriateness of the design

Design Guidelines for Hampton Heights state that “..... The dominant exterior materials used in a neighborhood or historic district contribute to the visual relationships among buildings. Retain original wood siding and repair rather than replace damaged material whenever possible. When replacement is necessary, replace only deteriorated materials and match the original material in size, shape, texture, and material. Paint removal and repainting shall be done using appropriate techniques that do not damage the historic material. The application of artificial or nonhistorical exterior siding materials such as brick veneers; asphalt shingle siding; and cementitious, aluminum, or vinyl siding is strongly discouraged. These materials are not successful in mimicking details of original wood siding (the most common material over which they are applied); subsequently, their use greatly compromises the historic integrity of buildings. Application often results in the loss or distortion of architectural details, and improper installation can result in damage of historic materials.”

“.....Retain original porches and steps, repair of porches shall not result in the removal of original materials (such as balusters, columns, handrails, brackets, and roof detailing), unless seriously deteriorated. If replacement materials must be introduced, the new shall match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated, if possible, by documentary and physical evidence.

“..... Retain original doors unless deteriorated beyond repair. Screen and storm doors shall not detract from the character of the house and shall be designed to be compatible with original doors. In the case of a replacement for a deteriorated door, the new door shall be similar to the original in design and materials. Original door openings shall not be infilled on facades visible from the public right-of-way.”

- The applicant proposes to repair the siding using the wood siding from the back and install new vinyl siding on two side walls. Replace back porch using wood, and replace the front door with metal door.
- The Design Guidelines for the Hampton Heights states that “..... original wood siding should be retained and repair rather than replacement. When replacement is necessary, replace only deteriorated materials and match the original material in size, shape, texture, and material.
- Vinyl siding and aluminum siding is strongly discouraged,” and that “.....original porches should be retained, and repair of porches shall not result in the removal of original materials. If replacement materials must be introduced, the new material shall match the old in design, color, texture, and materials”, and that “.....the original doors should be retained unless it is

deteriorated beyond repair. In case of a replacement for a deteriorated door, the new door shall be similar to the original in design and materials.”

b. The scale of the buildings

- Replacing / repairing siding, replace/replace rear deck, and replace the front door will not impact the scale of the building.

c. The texture and materials

- Currently, the existing siding is wood, the newly proposed siding on two side walls is vinyl.
- Replacement/repair of the rear deck will be wood.
- Replacement of the front door will be metal.

d. The relationship of such elements to similar features of structures in the immediate surroundings –

- Properties in the immediate surroundings of the project site appear to have a combination of vinyl siding and wood siding on them.
- Some properties in the immediate surroundings of the project site have an open porch in the front or side of the house made of wood or brick.
- Properties in the immediate surroundings of the project site appear all have wood front door.

e. If the property is in a Historic District, the extent to which the alteration or construction would be harmonious with the Historic District –

The Design Guidelines Hampton Heights states that “.....The dominant exterior materials used in a neighborhood or historic district contribute to the visual relationships among buildings. Retain original wood siding and repair rather than replace damaged material whenever possible. When replacement is necessary, replace only deteriorated materials and match the original material in size, shape, texture, and material. Paint removal and repainting shall be done using appropriate techniques that do not damage the historic material. The application of artificial or nonhistorical exterior siding materials such as brick veneers; asphalt shingle siding; and cementitious, aluminum, or vinyl siding is strongly discouraged. These materials are not successful in mimicking details of original wood siding (the most common material over which they are applied); subsequently, their use greatly compromises the historic integrity of buildings. Application often results in the loss or distortion of architectural details, and improper installation can result in damage of historic materials.”

“.....Retain original porches and steps, repair of porches shall not result in the removal of original materials (such as balusters, columns, handrails, brackets, and roof detailing), unless seriously deteriorated. If replacement materials must be introduced, the new shall match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated, if possible, by documentary and physical evidence.

“..... Retain original doors unless deteriorated beyond repair. Screen and storm doors shall not detract from the character of the house and shall be designed to be compatible with original doors. In the case of a replacement for a deteriorated door, the new door shall be similar to the original in design and materials. Original door openings shall not be infilled on facades visible from the public right-of-way.”

- Repair of the siding using wood siding from the back wherever needed would be harmonious with the Hampton Heights Historic District.
- Installation of white vinyl siding on the two sides walls would not be harmonious with the Hampton Heights Historic District.

- Replacement of the rear deck using wood would be harmonious with the Historic District.
- Replacement of the front door with a metal front door would not be harmonious with the Hampton Heights Historic District.
- Based on the Design Guidelines for Hampton Heights, the replacement siding should match the original material in size, shape, texture, and material. The application of artificial or nonhistorical exterior siding materials such as vinyl siding and aluminum siding are strongly discouraged. Original doors should be retained unless deteriorated beyond repair. The new replacement door should be similar to the original in design and materials.

Applicant:

Mike Epps, 200 Brookwood Ter.

Public Speakers:

None

Discussion:

The request before the board is multifaceted, with the primary issue being the replacement of a metal door with one more appropriate to the historic guidelines, such as a wooden door. Additionally, the vinyl should be removed and replaced with a material deemed appropriate by staff to meet the historic preservation standards. This would serve to differentiate the section of the property in question from the original house while maintaining the integrity of the historic structure.

A motion was made by Mr. Michel, seconded Mr. Brown to deny the replacement of the front door and the vinyl siding, while applying modifications to the rear porch. The applicant will be instructed to seek further board approval for an appropriate door and siding that align with the historic guidelines, ensuring differentiation between the original structure and the added laundry room at the rear by a vote of 6-0.

Staff Announcements: None.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:18 PM.



Bill Michels, Chairman