

**Meeting Minutes of the Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review
Thursday, December 12th, 2024, at 5:30 PM
Spartanburg County Council Chambers**

The City of Spartanburg Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review (HARB) met in County Council Chambers on Thursday, December 12th, 2024, at 5:30 PM with the following members in attendance: **Mark Olencki, Bill Michels, Kenneth Brown, Sylvelie Franke, James Gaffney and Rod McCants** Representing the Planning Department - **Fredalyn Frasier, Planning Director, Nan Zhou, Planner II, and Oksana Holbrooks, Sr Administrative Assistant.**

Roll Call:

Mr. Michels: Bill Michels
Mr. Brown: Kenneth Brown
Ms. Franke: Sylvelie Franke
Mr. Gaffney: James Gaffney
Mr. McCants: Rod McCants
Mr. Olencki: Mark Olencki

Mr. Michels: This meeting has been published, posted, and mailed in compliance with the Freedom of Information Act and the requirements of the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance.

Approval of Agenda:

A motion was made by Mr. Gaffney, seconded by Mr. Brown to approve the agenda. The motion was approved with a vote of 6-0.

Approval of Meeting Minutes from November 14th, 2024.

A motion was made by Mr. Brown, seconded by Mr. Gaffney to approve the meeting minutes as amended. The motion was approved with a vote of 6-0.

Old Business: None.

New Business:

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Works – 790 Southern St. (TMS # 7-08-15-276.00) in the Beaumont Mill Village Historic District. The applicant is seeking approval to rebuild the side deck and relocate the side door towards the back. The property is located in the R-6 (General Residential District) zoning district. Owner: Jessica Medina / Contractor: Vinicius Santos.

Project Description and History

The project site is located on an approximately 6,555 square foot lot in the Beaumont Mill Village Historic District on the west side of Southern Street. The site currently comprises a one-story single-family residence constructed in 1930. This residential structure is a vinyl-framed bungalow with a brick foundation. The structure has a front partial porch – recessed under main roof with interior brick chimney and has a gable roof with composite shingle. The Beaumont Mill Village Historic Design Guidelines list this structure as House Type Nine – Gabled with Partial Recessed Porch.

Analysis

Zoning Ordinance and Historic Design Manual Consistency

The design guidelines are outlined in the Beaumont Village Design Guidelines for the City of Spartanburg Historic District Preservation Principles and Approaches. The purpose of the Guidelines is to provide property owners guidance for the preservation and protection of historic and architecturally valuable districts and sites in the City. The project is also subject to Section 510 of the City's Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation. This section allows the Board to review applications involving historic structures and districts and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the Standards listed in the Ordinance.

The project site has a zoning designation of R-6, General Residential District, which allows for single family dwelling units. Section 510.6 of the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance list standards for reviewing Certificate of Appropriateness. Specifically, Section 510.6 (C)(2) states that in reviewing applications for new construction or alteration, the board shall consider the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the five criteria listed in the findings.

Findings

Certificate of Appropriateness, Section 510.6 (C)

a. The character and appropriateness of the design

Design Guidelines for Beaumont Mill Village states that ".....porches are an important design features on a house. They often have a lot of ornamental detailing such as posts and columns, brackets and balustrades. If the porch is determined to be rebuilt, it should have the same features and materials. Exterior renovations affecting houses with entry steps having four or more risers will require the addition of handrails and/or guardrails in accordance with the International Residential Code."

- The applicant proposes to rebuild the side deck using the same material (wood) to match the existing side deck material with guard rail around the deck.
- The Design Guidelines for the Beaumont Mill Village do not provide guidance for relocating the door. The applicant proposes to relocate the side door two or three feet from its current place towards the back based on the interior layout of the house.

b. The scale of the buildings

- Rebuilding the side deck and relocating the door will not impact the scale of the building.

c. The texture and materials

- The current side deck is a wood deck. The new proposed side deck would be a wood deck with guard rail around it.

d. The relationship of such elements to similar features of structures in the immediate surroundings –

- Properties in the immediate surroundings of the project site do not have a side deck or a side door. They all either have two or three windows on the sides of the house.

e. If the property is in a Historic District, the extent to which the alteration or construction would be harmonious with the Historic District –

The Design Guidelines for Beaumont Mill Village states that ".....porches are an important design features on a house. They often have a lot of ornamental detailing such as posts and columns, brackets and balustrades. If the porch is determined to be rebuilt, it should have the same features and materials.

Exterior renovations affecting houses with entry steps having four or more risers will require the addition of handrails and/or guardrails in accordance with the International Residential Code.”

- Rebuilding the side deck using same material would be harmonious with the Historic District Design Guidelines.
- Based on the Design Guidelines for the Beaumont Mill Village, shifting the door two or three feet over does not seem appropriate unless it will be covered by a window after the door is shifted to the proposed location.

Applicant:

Vinicius Santos.

Public Speakers:

None.

Discussion:

It appears that the deck in question is not original to the structure. Additionally, there is some uncertainty as to whether there was a window or an exit door at the back of the property.

A motion was made by Mr. Brown, seconded Ms. Franke to approve the moving door and replacing with window at current location with staff level approval on both with drawings, designs. and measurement's and allow the deck as described by representative by a vote of 4-2.

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Works – 593 S. Irwin Ave. (TMS # 7-16-06-013.00) in the Hampton Heights Neighborhood Historic District. The applicant is seeking approval to repair/replace siding using like for like material (wood) due to hurricane damage and install gutter on the house. The property is located in the R-8 SFD (General Residential – Single-Family) zoning district. Owner/Applicant: Adam and Angela Weber / Contractor: Browns Roofing Company.

Project Description and History

The project site is located on an approximately 9,480 square foot lot in the Hampton Heights Historic District on the east side of South Irwin Ave. The site currently includes one two-story single-family home constructed in 1920. The residential structure is a wood-framed bungalow with a brick foundation and an open front porch. This residential structure has a hip roof with composition shingle.

The applicant is seeking approval from the Board of Architectural Design and Historical Review to repair/replace wood siding with wood plank siding due to Hurricane Helene and install gutters around the house to protect molding on fascia and water runoff to foundation.

Analysis

Zoning Ordinance and Historic Design Manual Consistency

These Hampton Heights District guidelines are outlined in the Design Manual for the City of Spartanburg Historic Districts and Landmarks. The purpose of the Manual is to provide property owners guidance for the preservation and protection of historic and architecturally valuable districts and sites in the City. The project is also subject to Section 510 of the City's Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation. This section allows the Board to review applications involving historic structures and districts and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the Standards listed in the Ordinance.

The project site has a zoning designation of R-8/SFD, General Residential Single Family Zoning District, which allows for single family dwelling units. Section 510.6 of the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance lists standards for reviewing Certificate of Appropriateness. Specifically, Section 510.6 (C)(2) states that in reviewing applications for new construction or alteration, the board shall consider the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the five criteria listed in the findings.

Findings

Certificate of Appropriateness, Section 510.6 (C)

1. *The character and appropriateness of the design*

The Hampton Heights Residential Rehabilitation Guidelines states ".....retain original wood siding and repair rather than replace damaged material whenever possible. When replacement is necessary, replace only deteriorated materials and match the original material in size, shape, texture, and materials. Paint removal and repainting shall be done using appropriate techniques that do not damage the historic material."

- The applicant proposes to repair damaged siding using like materials (wood plank) and color (yellow for siding, white for trim), with sheathing and vapor barrier underneath the siding that will not be visible from exterior.

2. *The scale of the buildings*

- Replacing siding and installing gutter systems will not impact the scale of the building.

3. *The texture and materials*

- The texture of the siding would be wood plank.

4. *The relationship of such elements to similar features of structures in the immediate surroundings*

- The structures in the immediate surroundings share mixed types of exterior sidings in terms of texture and materials.
- Houses directly across from the project site and to the right side of the project site have vinyl exterior sidings, while the rest of the houses in the vicinity of the project site all have wood exterior sidings.

5. *If the property is in a Historic District, the extent to which the alteration or construction would be harmonious with the Historic District*

Hampton Heights Residential Rehabilitation Guidelines states ".....retain original wood siding and repair rather than replace damaged material whenever possible. When replacement is necessary, replace only deteriorated materials and match the original material in size, shape, texture, and materials."

The proposed work is to repair the damaged siding using like materials (wood plank) and color (yellow for siding, white for trim), with sheathing and vapor barrier underneath the siding to protect the siding for a sustainable future and installing gutter systems to the rest of the house to protect the house from water damage to the foundation would be harmonious with the Historic District.

Applicant:

Adam Weber

Public Speakers:

None.

Discussion:

Considering of the property's preservation guidelines, separate gutters and siding should be replaced only in areas where damage has occurred. This approach ensures minimal alteration to the original structure while addressing necessary repairs.

A motion was made by Mr. Michels, seconded Mr. Olencki to approve motion in two parts: granting approval of the gutter replacement by city staff to ensure theirs no damage to the fascia for mold currently on the house from the storm and secondly, siding on the left side and rear of the property specifically, and front and right side as needed to replace the individual boards that were damaged by the storm or of age as observed by city staff by a vote of 6-0.

Staff Announcements: None.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:20 PM.



Bill Michels, Chairman