

Meeting Minutes of the Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review
Thursday, November 14th, 2024, at 5:30 PM
Spartanburg County Council Chambers

The City of Spartanburg Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review (HARB) met in County Council Chambers on Thursday, November 14th, 2024, at 5:30 PM with the following members in attendance: **Bill Michels, Kenneth Brown, Sylvelie Franke, James Gaffney and Rod McCants** Representing the Planning Department - **Fredalyn Frasier, Planning Director, Nan Zhou, Planner II, and Oksana Holbrooks, Sr Administrative Assistant.**

Roll Call:

Mr. Michels: Bill Michels
Mr. Brown: Kenneth Brown
Ms. Franke: Sylvelie Franke
Mr. Gaffney: James Gaffney (Late Arrival)
Mr. McCants: Rod McCants

Mr. Michels: This meeting has been published, posted, and mailed in compliance with the Freedom of Information Act and the requirements of the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance.

Approval of Agenda:

A motion was made by Mr. Brown, seconded by Ms. Franke to approve the agenda. The motion was approved with a vote of 5-0.

Approval of Meeting Minutes from August 8th, 2024.

A motion was made by Mr. Brown, seconded by Mr. Gaffney to approve the agenda. The motion was approved with a vote of 5-0.

Old Business:

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Works – 400 Hampton Dr. (TMS # 7-16-02-141.00) in the Hampton Heights Neighborhood Historic District. The applicant is seeking approval to pave the parking area for tenants. The property is located in the R-8 SFD (General Residential – Single-Family District) zoning district. Owner/Applicant: Phuoc Do and Theresa Phan; Contractor: Work, Inc.

Applicant:

Phuoc Do, Owner.

Public Speakers:

Steve Battocchio, 175 W Hampton Avenue.
Sandy Battocchio, 175 W Hampton Avenue.
Niko Gilman, 460 Hampton Drive.

Discussion:

The proposed project does not meet the requirements of the Hampton Heights Design Guidelines.

A motion was made by Mr. Gaffney, seconded Ms. Franke to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness as presented by a vote of 5-0.

New Business:

Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Works – 651 Maywood St. (TMS # 7-12-03-070.00) in the Beaumont Mill Village Historic District. The applicant is seeking approval to replace a metal roof with asphalt shingle roof. The property is located in the R-6 (General Residential District) zoning district. Owner: Eric & Israel Shackley; Agent: Fraser Roofing.

Project Description and History

The project site is located on an approximately 5,960 square foot lot in the Beaumont Mill Village Historic District. The site is located on the south side of Maywood Street. The site currently contains one one-story single-family home that was constructed in 1890. This residential structure is a wood-framed bungalow with a brick foundation. The structure has an open front porch with interior chimney and has a gabled metal roof with long rear slope roof. The Beaumont Mill Village Historic Design Guidelines list this structure as House Type One – Saddlebag circa 1890-1910.

Analysis

Zoning Ordinance and Historic Design Manual Consistency

The project site is located in the Beaumont Mill Village Historic District which has design guidelines for development. These guidelines are outlined in the Beaumont Village Design Guidelines for the City of Spartanburg Historic District Preservation Principles and Approaches. The purpose of the Guidelines is to provide property owners guidance for the preservation and protection of historic and architecturally valuable districts and sites in the City. The project is also subject to Section 510 of the City's Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation. This section allows the Board to review applications involving historic structures and districts and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the Standards listed in the Ordinance.

The project site has a zoning designation of R-6, General Residential District, which allows for single family dwelling units. Section 510.6 of the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance lists standards for reviewing Certificate of Appropriateness. Specifically, Section 510.6 (C)(2) states that in reviewing applications for new construction or alteration, the board shall consider the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the five criteria listed in the findings.

Findings

Certificate of Appropriateness, Section 510.6 (C)

a. The character and appropriateness of the design

Currently the structure has a metal roof that was not original to the house. Beaumont Mill Design Guidelines Section 3.7.5 Roof Pitches and Roofing Materials says "metal roofs are not appropriate roofing materials for the Beaumont Mill Village. Architectural shingles may be appropriate for the earlier houses." The proposed architectural shingle roof meets the intent of Beaumont Mill Design Guidelines.

b. The scale of the buildings

The scale of the structure will not be impacted by replacing metal shingles with architectural shingles.

c. The texture and materials

The agent is proposing to install CertainTeed Landmark, a 40-year architectural shingles as the new roof material.

d. The relationship of such elements to similar features of structures in the immediate surroundings

Residential properties in the vicinity of the project site all have architectural shingles. The proposed architectural shingles will share similar features of structures in the immediate surroundings.

e. If the property is in a Historic District, the extent to which the alteration or construction would be harmonious with the Historic District

The Beaumont Mill Village Design Guidelines clearly states that” metal roofs are not appropriate roofing material for the Beaumont Mill Village. Architectural shingles may be appropriate for the earlier houses.” The proposed alteration of the roof will be harmonious with the Beaumont Mill Village Historic District and meets the intent of the Design Guidelines.

Based on the Beaumont Mill Village Design Guidelines, it is recommended and appropriate to replace the existing metal roof with architectural shingles for the project site that will be harmonious with the immediate surroundings and with the Historic District.

Applicant:

Eric & Israel Shackley, Owner.

Public Speakers:

None.

Discussion:

The proposed project is well presented and meets the requirements of the Hampton Heights Design Guidelines. This will not be detrimental to the surrounding properties.

A motion was made by Mr. Brown, seconded Ms. Franke to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as presented by a vote of 5-0.

Staff Announcements: 642 Maywood Street, Demolition.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:07 PM.



Bill Michels, Chairman