

**Meeting Minutes of the Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review**  
**Tuesday, November 9<sup>th</sup>, 2023, at 5:30 PM**  
**City Hall Council Chambers**

The City of Spartanburg Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review (HARB ) met in City Hall Council Chambers on Tuesday, November 9<sup>th</sup>, 2023, at 5:30PM with the following members in attendance: **Bill Michels, Brandon Gaffney, Kenneth Brown, Mark Olencki, Rod McCants, Michael Pittillo and Sylvelie Franke.** Representing for the Planning Department is, **Nan Zhou, Planner II, Tia Keitt, Planner II, and Oksana Holbrooks, Administrative Assistant.**

**Roll Call:**

Mr. Michels: Bill Michels  
Mr. McCants: Rod McCants.  
Mr. Gaffney: Brandon Gaffney  
Mr. Brown: Kenneth Brown  
Ms. Franke: Sylvelie Franke  
Mr. Olencki: Mark Olencki  
Mr. Pittillo: Mr. Michael Pittillo

Mr. Gaffney: The Freedom of Information Act Compliance called for public notification to the City of Spartanburg's Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review meeting has been published, posted, and mailed in compliance with the Freedom of Information Act and the requirements of the City of Spartanburg Zoning Ordinance.

Mr. Gaffney: Before we entertain a motion I wanted to let those in the attendance and board members know that item number three Major Works for 544 S Irwin Ave the owner has requested we table discussion for this item to another meeting, they are not able to attend the meeting for being out of town.

**Approval of Agenda:**

**A motion was made by Mr. Michels, seconded Mr. Brown approve the agenda. The motion was approved with a vote of 7-0.**

Mr. Gaffney: It's been properly moved in second. All those in favor of accepting the agenda with the added addendum say aye.

Attendees: Aye.

Mr. Gaffney: Are there any nays? Ayes have it.

**Approval of Meeting Minutes from September 14<sup>th</sup>, 2023.**

**A motion was made by Mr. Olencki, seconded Mr. Brown approve the agenda. The motion was approved with a vote of 7-0.**

Mr. Gaffney: It's been properly moved in second. All those in favor accepting minutes as presented please say aye.

Attendees: Aye.

**Old Business: None.**

## **New Business:**

**Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Works – Applicant is seeking approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate an exiting garage with a bonus room for storage above. The property is located at 607 S. Irwin Ave. in Hampton Heights Historic District and is currently zoned as the R-8/SFD (TMS# 7-16-02-237.00). Landowner/Applicant: Brian K. Byrd**

Ms. Zhou: Good evening boards my name is Nan Zhou and I'm working with the City of Spartanburg Planning Department. I swear to tell the truth.

### **Project Description and History**

The project site is located on an approximately 10,934 square foot lot in the Hampton Heights Historic District. The site is located on the east side of South Irwin Avenue. The site currently contains one single-family home that was constructed in 1947. This residential structure is a one-story bungalow with a brick foundation. The structure has an open porch in the front. This residential structure has a gable roof with comp shingle.

The detached existing concrete garage had a roof back in the past but weathered with time and was taken off. The owner applied for three Certificate of Appropriateness applications about reroofing the garage with identical material (asphalt shingles) to what was there originally in 2009, January 2022 and April 2023 and were approved by Planning staff.

Later, the Building Department inspectors found out that the owner added a bonus room on top of the existing concrete garage without a Certificate of Appropriateness and a building permit. The case was taken to the court and the Judge made the decision asking the applicant/homeowner to apply for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the Planning Department.

The applicant is seeking approval from the Board of Architectural Design and Historical Review to renovate an existing garage with a bonus room for storage above.

### **Analysis**

#### *Zoning Ordinance & Hampton Heights Historic Design Manual Consistency*

The development request is subject to **Section 510 of the City's Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation & the Design Manual for the City of Spartanburg Historic Districts & Landmarks, Section 6.0**. These sections enables the Board to review applications involving historic structures and districts and issue a **Certificate of Appropriateness** subject to the Standards listed in the Ordinance. **Section 510.4(c)** Power and Duties of the Board Review application for and, where appropriate, issue Certificates of Appropriateness permitting the rehabilitation, alteration, reconstruction, or demolition of structures on or changes to Historic Sites.

### **Findings**

#### **Certificate of Appropriateness, Section 510.6 (C)**

##### **1. *The character and appropriateness of the design –***

The proposed sketch is a nice historic house design with an inviting front porch. It's different then neighboring properties where the home to the right has a porch with pickings and railings, and the home to the left does not have a front porch, but does have a side porch. The proposed design offers a different character than existing homes along Carlisle Street.

**2. *The scale of the buildings –***

A one and a half story home to fill a vacant lot where Hydrick & Carlisle Streets intersect. The home that used to be there was a single story building with an enclosed porch (image found in Vivian B. Fisher's book) Neighboring properties are single story with low roof pitches with wide gables. As a two-story structure the pitch will be higher than adjoining properties and the scale will be impacted.

**3. *The texture and materials –***

The builder plans to use materials to replicate historic homes: Hard Lap Siding, Painted wood True Divided Lite Windows, Shutters, Asphalt shingle roof, Wood columns, trim and rafter tails.

**4. *The relationship of such elements to similar features of structures in the immediate surroundings –***

The neighboring properties have a different pitch and the porch styles are in no way similar. Section 6.2.2 Directional Emphasis and 6.2.3 Shape states Guidelines for new construction within Hampton Heights Historic District. The front entrance of the new home is unique, and reminds you of bungalows from the low country area of South Carolina.

**5. *If the property is in a Historic District, the extent to which the alteration or construction would be harmonious with the Historic District –***

313 Hydrick Street has a similar front porch style as proposed for 187 Carlisle St., yet the characteristics of the design stand out along Carlisle St. It's definitely different from the home that used to be at this location. Quick question, would the old design be approved today?

**Applicant:**

Brian K. Byrd

**Consultant:**

Donnie Love, Preservation Architect

**Public Speakers:**

None.

**Discussion:**

Historic District Guidelines don't specify anything pertaining to accessory structures. The accessory structures should be compatible with the house and the neighborhood. The accessory structure constructed on the property is not up to code.

**A motion was made by Mr. Brown, seconded Mr. Michels to deny the COA based on not having proper permits and not meeting guidelines with a vote of 7-0.**

**Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Works – 527 Beaumont Avenue (TMS: 7-08-15-118.00) in the Beaumont Mill Village Historic District. Applicant is seeking approval to replace seven (7) existing windows with vinyl windows. The property is located in an R-6 (General Residential District). Owner/Applicant: Virginia Painter / Contractor: Chris Adams; Window World.**

Ms. Zhou: Good evening. My name is Tia Keitt I'm a Planner with City of Spartanburg. I do.

## **Project Description and History**

A Saddlebag style home located in the Beaumont Mill Village Historic District. The homeowner shared that the home has a mixture of windows, most of which are not original to the home. Some of the current windows do not open and need to be replaced. The COA requests seven (7) windows need to be replaced, but six (6) of the windows are visible from the sidewalk. There are two (2) types of windows on the house, four (4) with a metal trim and two (2) with wood trim, which looks like the 4 over 4 style.

The owner has contracted Window World of Greenville to install the new windows. In an effort to minimize costs, the owner prefers to **not** have window grids.

## **Analysis**

The request is subject to Section 510 of the Spartanburg Historic Preservation Ordinance. This section allows the Board to review applications involving historic structures and districts and issue a Certificate of Appropriateness subject to the Standards listed in the Ordinance. A Certificate of Appropriateness "COA" shall be required for all alteration, construction, demolition, or removal requiring a building or demolition permit by the Inspections Division or for any alteration, construction, demolition, relocation, or removal not requiring a building or demolition permit which changes the exterior architectural appearance of a site on the Spartanburg Historic Register.

In reviewing applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Board shall base its decisions upon the standards in this Ordinance and shall make no requirements other than for the purpose of preventing construction or alterations which are not in harmony with the prevailing character of the Historic District or Historic site.

## **Beaumont Mill Village Design Manual Consistency**

§3.7.2 Windows -Window replacement is Major Work if original windows are still existing, minor work if original windows have been replaced. Wood and aluminum clad wood windows are the most appropriate replacement materials. Other window materials will be evaluated by the Board of Architectural Design and Historic Review

In reviewing applications for new construction or alteration, the Board shall consider the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the following criteria:

## **Findings**

### **Certificate of Appropriateness, Section 510.6 (C)**

#### ***a. The character and appropriateness of the design –***

The proposed windows are defined as Custom Exterior Trim/Wrap Wood Out, Vinyl with double sliding. The owner would prefer to not have a grid, but will install this style if required. The windows that look original to the home are 4 over 4. **Section 3.7.2** of the Beaumont Mill Village Design Guidelines recognizes the 6 over 6 as an original window configuration common throughout the historic district.

#### ***b. The scale of the buildings –***

The scale of the building will not be impacted by the installation of windows.

#### ***c. The texture and materials –***

The proposed materials include aluminum coils to cover vinyl. Wood will be replaced with wood where rotten wood exists. The proposed window type is listed as the 4000 Series DH w/ Sola Zone 129. From the Window World website: In the vicinity of the project site, the house directly across

from the project site has a storage building in the back yard. Two houses down from the right side of the project site have a storage room in the back yard, and there are two houses across from the project site has storage room in their back yard.

***d. The relationship of such elements to similar features of structures in the immediate surroundings –***

Throughout Beaumont Mill Village, there are a mixture of original windows, newly installed windows with grid and windows without the grid. Images are included in the staff report for reference. Some windows are circled in red.

***e. If the property is in a Historic District, the extent to which the alteration or construction would be harmonious with the Historic District –***

The homes of Beaumont Mill Village Historic District offers a mixture of windows, some original to the homes, newer windows with a grid or older windows with metal trim and no grid. Homes with the grid offer a distinct look that compliments the historic preservation of the district.

**Applicant:**

Virginia Painter  
Chris Adams; Window World.

**Consultant:**

Donnie Love, Preservation Architect

**Public Speakers:**

None.

**Discussion:**

The windows are not the originals and may be from the 70's. The current windows are half wooden single wide and half aluminum that fall outside the period of significance. Vinyl windows are not allowed per guidelines.

**A motion was made by Mr. Michels, seconded Mr. Olencki to deny the request as written and reapply for any other acceptable window with a vote of 7-0.**

**Staff Updates:**

Staff is expecting two new construction applications for December's meeting along with the case that was tabled tonight.

**The meeting was adjourned at 6:26 PM.**



---

Bill Michels, Vice Chairman